

Birmingham Township Historical Commission
Minutes of the Special Meeting of November 8, 2010

Chairman Will Snook declared a quorum and called the meeting to order at 7 p.m. in the Township Building. Present were Matt Bedwell, Lloyd Roach, Mark Gross, Betty Organt, and Scott Garrison. Ed Zaloga was excused from attending. Mr. Snook announced that the purpose of this special meeting was to review an application for the replacement of the roof on the James Painter Mansion at Radley Run Country Club. The meeting was advertised in the *Daily Local News* on November 2, 2010. Club Manager Joe Mendez presented a map and certified mail receipts from the surrounding neighbors who had been notified of the meeting. Mr. Snook announced that he would recuse himself from voting on the issue because he is a member of Radley Run Country Club.

The Painter Mansion is listed as a Class II structure on the Birmingham Township Historic Resource Inventory. Mike Culliney, President of the club's Board of Directors, stated that the club's goal is to preserve the mansion, so they had sought bids for a cedar shake replacement, but the cost of cedar was \$23,000.00 more than for a fiberglass asphalt composite shingle (which will cost \$50,000.00). Mr. Mendez displayed pictures from the manufacturer's website showing houses with the composite shingles. The application is for replacing the current cedar roof with CertainTeed Grand Manor Luxury Shingles in a "Weathered Wood" color. A sample was displayed. The job will include an ice shield and copper pole gutters. The club Board rejected slate as historically inappropriate.

Mr. Bedwell asked if the club was intending to put the mansion on the National Register. Mr. Mendez said that was not their first priority; preservation is the first priority. Mr. Snook asked if this replacement would still allow for a cedar roof in the future. Mr. Culliney said it would. Mr. Bedwell said that, while the composite may be the best alternative, it won't look like cedar. Mr. Culliney stated that the Board has a fiduciary responsibility to the dwindling membership and that the last rainstorm did \$450,000.00 damage, and capital expenditures for this year alone are \$423,000.00, noting that the current cedar 24-inch royals have only lasted twenty years and the composite is supposed to last at least fifty years. Mrs. Organt noted that cedar roofs are outlawed as a fire hazard in Dallas, Texas, where she used to live.

Mr. Roach made a motion to approve the application and recommend that the Birmingham Township Board of Supervisors approve the proposal for replacing the James Painter Mansion roof with CertainTeed Grand Manor Luxury Shingles in a "Weathered Wood" color. Mrs. Organt seconded the motion and it was approved with four in favor and Mr. Snook abstaining. Mr. Bedwell opposed the motion on the basis of the replacement not being in the best interests of historic preservation. Mr. Roach commended the club on its efforts to maintain its historic buildings.

The meeting adjourned at 7:28.

Respectfully submitted,

Jacquie Roach

This document was created with Win2PDF available at <http://www.win2pdf.com>.
The unregistered version of Win2PDF is for evaluation or non-commercial use only.
This page will not be added after purchasing Win2PDF.